

# **SOUTH HAMS DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE**



**Minutes** of a meeting of the **South Hams Development Management Committee** held on **Wednesday, 10th January, 2018 at 11.00 am** at the **Council Chamber - Follaton House**

Present: **Councillors:**

**Chairman** Cllr Steer  
**Vice Chairman** Cllr Foss

Cllr Bramble  
Cllr Brown  
Cllr Hodgson  
Cllr Pearce  
Cllr Vint

Cllr Brazil  
Cllr Cuthbert  
Cllr Holway  
Cllr Rowe

**In attendance:**

Councillors:

Cllr Baldry  
Cllr Pennington  
Cllr Wright

Cllr Bastone  
Cllr Tucker

Officers:  
COP Lead Development Management  
Planning Specialists  
Deputy Monitoring Officer

37. **Minutes**  
DM.37/17  
The minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 29 November 2017 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.
38. **Declarations of Interest**  
DM.38/17  
Members and officers were invited to declare any interests in the items of business to be considered and the following were made:

Cllr J Brazil declared a personal interest in application **1894/17/FUL**: Enlargement of existing car park to provide up to 15 spaces and new car park to provide up to 10 spaces – Land at SX 740491 and 742 498, Avon Valley Woods, Hendon Road, Woodleigh by virtue of being a member of the Woodland Trust and he remained in the meeting and took part in the debate and vote thereon.

Cllr D Brown declared a personal interest in the following planning applications that were sited within the South Devon AONB by virtue of being a Member of the South Devon AONB Partnership Committee and remained in the meeting and took part in the debate and vote thereon:

- **3787/17/HHO**: Householder application for proposed gable roof extension – Bantham House, Bantham
- **3075/17/HHO**: Householder application for proposed alterations and extension – 21 Court Park, Thurlestone
- **1174/17/HHO**: Householder application for a proposed extension to an existing dwelling – Whitelands Barn, Thorn Farm, Venn
- **3117/17/FUL**: Replacement of existing dwelling with single dwelling – 59 Yealm Road, Newton Ferrers.

39. **Public Participation**

DM.39/17

The Chairman announced that a list of members of the public and town and parish council representatives, who had registered their wish to speak at the meeting, had been circulated.

40. **Planning Applications**

DM.40/17

The Committee considered the details of the planning applications prepared by the Planning Case Officers as presented in the agenda papers, and considered also the comments of Town and Parish Councils together with other representations received, which were listed within the presented agenda reports, and **RESOLVED** that:

**3787/17/HHO     Bantham House, Bantham  
Parish: Thurlestone**

**Householder application for proposed gable roof extension  
(resubmission of 1851/17/HHO)**

Case Officer Update:     None

Speakers included:     Supporter – Mrs Debbie Crowther: Parish Council representative – Cllr Tony Goddard; local Ward Members – Cllrs Pearce and Wright

**Recommendation:**     Conditional Approval

During discussion, Members were broadly supportive but felt the design of the proposal could be improved if the gable were sloped rather than vertical. The agent indicated acceptance of the revision and the recommendation was amended accordingly.

**Committee Decision:** Conditional Approval delegated to COP Lead in consultation with Chairman and local Ward Members, subject to receipt of revised plans showing changes discussed.

**Conditions:**

1. Standard time
2. Accord with plans
3. Materials to be agreed
4. Construction details
5. Details of doors and windows to be agreed

**3075/17/HHO 21 Court Park, Thurlestone  
Parish: Thurlestone**

**Householder application for proposed alterations and extension**

Case Officer Update: 5 late letters of objection received, no new issues raised

Speakers included: Objector – Ms Jenny Webb: Parish Council representative – Cllr Tony Goddard: local Ward Members – Cllrs Pearce and Wright

**Recommendation:** Conditional Approval

During discussion, Members considered the elements of the proposal in detail, and comparisons were made with other properties in the vicinity. Whilst other properties had balconies, having had a site visit, some Members felt there would be an unacceptable impact on the neighbour at no. 22 of the proposed upper floor balcony.

**Committee Decision:** Refusal

Reasons:

The proposed first floor balcony would result in an unacceptable degree of overlooking and significant loss of amenity upon the neighbouring properties within the immediate area and therefore would be contrary to Local Plan Policies Development Plan Document Policy DP3 (Residential Amenity) and emerging Plymouth and South West Devon Joint Local Plan policies DEV1 (Protecting amenity and the environment) and the National Planning Policy Framework in particular paragraph 17.

The drawings to which this proposal relates are drawing numbers 1330/04 (Location Plan) received by the Local Planning Authority on 21st September 2017 and drawing number 1330/05/F received by the Local Planning Authority on 9th January 2018.

**1174/17/HHO Whitelands Barn, Thorn Farm, Venn  
Parish: Stoke Fleming**

**Householder application for a proposed extension to an existing dwelling**

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: Supporter – Mr Mark Evans

**Recommendation:** Refusal

During discussion, some Members agreed with the officer recommendation of refusal. However, having been on site and considered that the proposal was hidden by virtue of landscape, and the innovative design and high specification of the proposal, the majority of Members felt the application should be approved.

**Committee Decision:** Conditional Approval

Reasons:

The extension complied with para's 135 of NPPF and Council's SPD.

**Conditions**

- Standard time
- Accords with plans
- Samples of finishing materials
- Agreement on finish of doors and windows
- Constructional details at a scale of 1:20 of all eaves and verges shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. All new and replacement fascia boards shall be fitted tight to the wall face. The barge shall be finished either with a close fitting board or natural slate, or the wall finish taken directly up to the underside of the roof covering.

**1239/17/FUL Totnes Road to Westerland Lane, Marldon  
Parish: Marldon**

**Retrospective application for erection of horse walker**

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: local Ward Member – Cllr Pennington

**Recommendation:** Conditional Approval

**Committee Decision:** Conditional Approval

**Conditions:**

- Accord with plans
- No more than 10 horses
- No more than one paid livery horse
- No external lighting on horse walker without consent

**1894/17/FUL Land at SX 740 491 and 742 498, Avon Valley Woods, Hendon Road, Woodleigh Parish: Woodleigh**

**Enlargement of existing car park to provide up to 15 spaces and new car park to provide up to 10 spaces**

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: Supporter – Mr Kenneth Papenfus: Parish representative – Cllr Hembrough: local Ward Member – Cllr Bramble (statement read)

**Recommendation:** Conditional Approval

During discussion, it was suggested that an additional condition be included requesting a management plan to include collection of litter

**Committee Decision:** Conditional Approval

**Conditions**

- Standard Time Limit
- Accords with plans
- Provision of post and rail fence
- No external lighting without consent
- Management plan to be submitted

**3117/17/FUL 59 Yealm Road, Newton Ferrers Parish: Newton and Noss**

**Replacement of existing dwelling with single dwelling**

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: Objector: Mrs Deborah McCann: Supporter – Mr Stephen Whettem: Parish Council Representative – Cllr Alison Ansell: local Ward Member – Cllr Baldry

**Recommendation:** Conditional Approval

Members had a detailed discussion on this application. A number of Members wanted to support the parish council position of refusal based on the emerging Neighbourhood Plan. Other comments included the proposal being in the wrong position on the site and not fitting into local context. Other Members felt the property was 'past its sell by date', and would be impossible to make energy efficient. There were other examples of modern design within the village.

It was **PROPOSED, SECONDED** and on being put to the vote declared **LOST**, that the application be refused.

**Committee Decision:** Conditional Approval

**Conditions**

1. Time limit
2. Accord with plans
3. Schedule of external materials
4. Mitigation in ecology report to be carried out
5. Unsuspected contamination condition
6. Removal of PD (extensions, outbuildings, roof alterations)
7. Hours of delivery between 9am and 5pm

**3207/17/ADV New Mills Industrial Estate, Church Road, Modbury  
Parish: Modbury**

**Advertisement consent application for erection of 1no. sign**

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: None

**Recommendation:** Conditional Approval

**Committee Decision:** Conditional Approval

**Conditions:**

1. Accord with plans
2. Standard advert condition – permission of site owner required
3. Standard advert condition – security
4. Standard advert condition – maintenance
5. Standard advert condition – public safety
6. Standard advert condition – tidy site after removal

41. **Planning Appeals Update**

DM.41/17

Members noted the list of appeals as outlined in the presented agenda report. The COP Lead Development Management presented further detail on specific cases.

The Meeting concluded at 4.30 pm

**Signed by:**

**Chairman**

---

**This page is intentionally left blank**



## Voting Analysis for Planning Applications – DM Committee 10 January 2018

<b>Application No:</b>	<b>Site Address</b>	<b>Vote</b>	<b>Councillors who Voted Yes</b>	<b>Councillors who Voted No</b>	<b>Councillors who Voted Abstain</b>	<b>Absent</b>
3787/17/HHO	Bantham House, Bantham	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Steer, Foss, Holway, Brown, Rowe, Cuthbert, Vint (7)	Cllrs Pearce, Bramble (2)	(0)	Cllrs Brazil, Hitchins, Hodgson (3)
3075/17/HHO	21 Court Park, Thurlestone	Refusal	Cllrs Foss, Pearce, Bramble, Brown, Vint (5)	Cllrs Steer, Rowe, Cuthbert, Holway (4)	(0)	Cllrs Brazil, Hitchins, Hodgson (3)
1174/17/HHO	Whitelands Barn, Thorn Farm, Venn	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Holway, Vint, Brown, Hodgson, Pearce, Brazil (6)	Cllrs Cuthbert, Rowe, Steer, Foss (4)	(0)	Cllrs Bramble, Hitchins (2)
1239/17/FUL	Totnes Road to Westerland Lane, Marldon	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Rowe, Steer, Foss, Holway, Vint, Brown, Brazil, Pearce, Hodgson, Cuthbert (10)	(0)	(0)	Cllrs Bramble, Hitchins (2)
1894/17/FUL	Land at SX 740 491 & 742 498, Avon Valley Woods, Hendon Road, Woodleigh	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Foss, Holway, Vint, Brown, Brazil, Pearce, Rowe, Steer, Cuthbert (9)	(0)	Cllr Hodgson (1)	Cllrs Bramble, Hitchins (2)
3117/17/FUL	59 Yealm Road, Newton Ferrers	Refusal	Cllrs Brazil, Pearce, Hodgson (3)	Cllrs Foss, Holway, Rowe, Steer, Cuthbert, Vint (6)	(0)	Cllrs Bramble, Hitchins, Brown (3)
3117/17/FUL	59 Yealm Road, Newton Ferrers	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Foss, Steer, Cuthbert, Holway, Rowe, Vint (6)	Cllrs Brazil, Pearce, Hodgson (3)	(0)	Cllrs Bramble, Hitchins, Brown (3)
3207/17/ADV	New Mills Industrial Estate, Church Road, Modbury	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Foss, Holway, Brazil, Pearce, Rowe, Steer, Hodgson, Cuthbert, Vint (9)	(0)	(0)	Cllrs Bramble, Hitchins, Brown (3)

